Contents

Translator's Preface ix
Preface xi
Prologue xv

1. Buffon and the Inferiority of the Animal Species of America 3
   i. The Absence of Large Wild Animals 3
   ii. The Deterioration of the Domestic Animals 5
   iii. The Hostility of Nature 5
   iv. The Impotence of the Savage 6
   v. The Cold and Humidity of the American Environment 7
   vi. Putrescence and Generation—Water and Life 8
   vii. America as a New Continent 14
   viii. The Larger Species More Perfect and More Stable than the Small 15
   ix. Buffon's Aversion for Minutiae and Small Animals 16
   x. Quantitative Criteria and Literary Scruples 21
   xi. The Stable Superior to the Changeable: Aristotle 22
   xii. Volume and Perfection in Modern Zoology 25
   xiii. The Instability and Decadence of the Domestic Species 26
   xiv. Reflections on the New World 27
   xv. Nomenclature as the Cause of Confusion 28
   xvi. Conclusions 29
      a. Buffon and Montesquieu 29
      b. Zoological Geography: Europe and America 31
      c. The New Concept of Species 32

2. Some Figures of the Enlightenment 35
   i. Hume and the Inferiority of the Inhabitants of the Tropics 35
   ii. Bodin's Theory of Climates 36
   iii. The Theory of Climates from Tasso to Hume 39
   iv. Voltaire: The Beardless Indian and the Cowardly Lion 42
   v. Raynal: America as Immature and the Americans Decrepit 45
   vi. Marmontel and the Defense of the Weak and Wretched Americans 50

3. De Pauw and the Inferiority of the Men of America 52
   i. Faith in Progress and Society 52
   ii. The Americans as Degenerate 53
   iii. Exaggerations in the Anti-American Thesis 56
   iv. The Causes of the Catastrophe 58
   v. Bacon: America a Sodden Continent 60
   vi. The Indian as Animal and the Indian as Weakling 63
   vii. The Indian a Slave by Nature: Aristotle, Las Casas, and Sepúlveda 67
VIII. Climate and Natural Slavery  74
IX. The Ineffectiveness of the Laws for the Protection of the Indians  76

4. European Reactions to de Pauw  80
   I. Reactions Immediate and Delayed  80
   II. Pernety and the American Giants  82
   III. Pernety Against Buffon: The Counterattack on Europe  86
   IV. De Pauw’s Answer to Pernety: Degeneration and Progress  88
   V. Pernety’s Second Offensive: *Repetita Minime Juvant*  93
   VI. De Pauw’s Opinion Unaltered  98

VII. The Philosopher La Douceur and the Natives of North America  102

VIII. Paolo Frisi Criticizes de Pauw’s Physicoclimatic Thesis  108

IX. Delisle de Sales, de Pauw’s Admiring Adversary  111
X. The Abbé Roubaud: America and the Physiocrats  117
XI. Galiani: The “Roughcast” Continent and the World of the Future  122

XII. The Glorious Future of the West  129

XIII. Mlle Philpon and Her Schoolfriend  145

XIV. Voltaire, Frederick of Prussia, and de Pauw’s Second *Recherches*  150

XV. Buffon’s New Position: America as Immature, but the American Strong and Handsome  154

5. The Second Phase of the Dispute  157
   I. The Polemic Expanded and Uplifted  157
   II. Robertson and the Vastness and Poverty of Nature in America  158
   III. Goldsmith’s Songless Birds  161
   IV. Robertson and the American Native  165
   V. The Explorers of Polynesia: James Cook and George Forster, Horace Walpole and Lord Kames  169
   VI. Two Supporters of de Pauw: Daniel Webb and Antonio Fenticelli  179
   VII. The Long-lasting Antagonism Between Spaniard and Creole  182
   VIII. The Pride of the Creoles  183
   IX. The Defense of the Creole: Garcilaso and Feijoo  186
   X. The Expulsion of the Jesuits  187
   XI. The Spanish Jesuits: Father Nuix Makes Use of de Pauw  191
   XII. De Pauw’s First American Opponent  194
   XIII. The American Jesuits: Father Clavigero  195
      A. Fundamental Aim of the Work, the Refutation of de Pauw  197
      B. The Arguments Reversed  200
      C. The Defense of the Mexican Indian  203
      D. Moral Vices, Religion, and Cannibalism  206
      E. The Precursors of His Polemical Technique  208
   XIV. Father Molina’s *Natural History of Chile*  212
      A. The Rehabilitation of Nature in Chile  213
      B. Respectful Disagreement with Buffon  215
   XV. Fathers Velasco, Jolis, and Peramas: Quito, the Chaco, and the River Plate  217
   XVI. Carlí’s *American Letters*  233
   XVII. Franklin and the North Americans’ Stature  240
   XVIII. Paine: The Promise of Greatness in America’s Nature  245
   XIX. Hamilton and Crèvecoeur  250
   XX. Thomas Jefferson’s *Notes on Virginia*  252
      A. The Mammoth and America’s Humidity  254
      B. The Animals Compared by Volume  257
Contents

C. The Indios and the Redskins 258
D. The White Man in America 262
E. Buffon, the Panther, and the Elk 263
xxi. Filippo Mazzei: Experience Against Idealization and Calumny 268
xxii. The Botanist Castiglioni and the Lascivious North American Colonists 275
xxiii. The Vindication of America’s Youth 281
xxiv. Herder and the American Problem 284

6. The Reaction to de Pauw in Spanish America 289
   I. Characteristics of the Latin American Reaction to the European Slanders 289
   II. Dávalos and the Climate of Peru 291
   III. Salas and the Happy Earth of Chile 292
   IV. Iturri and Muñoz’s History 293
   V. Moxó: Mexico Defended by a Spaniard 298
   VI. Unáuex: Lima’s Climate and Her Collegians’ Erudition 302
   VII. Dávila Condemarin: A Belated Apology of the University of San Marcos 305
   VIII. Caldas and the Cold in New Granada 308
   IX. The Mexican S. T. de Mier and de Pauw in the Cortes of Cadiz 312
   X. Other Reactions in Latin America: The Youthfulness of the New World 316
   XI. The Honduran J. C. del Valle and the Mission of America 317

7. Hegel and His Contemporaries 325
   I. The Americans Politically Dismissed and Their Zoological Problems Dissolved 325
   II. Kant: A New Opinion of the American 329
   III. Thomas Moore: A Wretched People in a Splendid Land 335
   IV. Volney and Perrin du Lac: Criticisms of the North Americans 339
   V. Keats: The Flight of the Dryads 343
   VI. Byron and Shelley: The Recherches sur les Grecs and the Radiant Destiny of the United States 346
   VII. Chateaubriand: America’s Pernicious Splendor 352
   VIII. Goethe: An America Without Basalt or Manor Houses 358
   IX. Lenau: The Promised Land Becomes the Accursed Land 372
   X. Leopardi: America’s Decadence Becomes Universal 380
   XI. De Maistre: The Degeneration of the American Savage 389
   XII. Fabre d’Olivet: America Rejected by the Theosophists 395
   XIII. The Reaction of the Scientists: Barton and Humboldt 402
   A. Benjamin Smith Barton and the Learned North Americans 402
   B. Humboldt’s Enthusiasm for Tropical America 405
   C. His Criticisms of Buffon and de Pauw 409
   XIV. Hegel: America Immature and Impotent 417
   A. Overall Judgment, Severe and Impassive 417
   B. The Restoration of the Philosophy of Nature 418
   C. Radical Antievolutionism 420
   D. The Impotence of Nature 422
   E. Deduction of the Hemispheres and the Continents 423
   F. Old World and New World 424
   G. The Impotence of America in Its Fauna 426
   H. The American Birds and Their Songs 429
Contents

1. The Savage as Man of Nature 430
2. The American Aborigines 431
3. Contemporary America: America and the "Spirits of Peoples" 433
4. The United States and South America 435
5. The Character of Hegel's Error 438
6. The Thesis Less Vigorous in Hegel Than in Buffon 439
7. The Historicization and Dissolution of the Thesis 440
8. The Chain of Being and the Old Metaphysics 440

8. The Dispute's Trivialization and Obstinate Vitality 442
   1. Dislocation of the Terms of the Polemic After Hegel 442
   2. Friedrich Schlegel: The Zoological and Anthropological Poverty of America 445
   3. Zoologists and Anthropologists: Guano and the Savages 449
   4. Darwin: The South American Fauna and the Evolution of the Species 454
   5. Schopenhauer: America's Animals and Savages as Decadent or Imperfect Forms 456
   6. The Saint-Simonians and Auguste Comte 459
   7. Edgar Quinet: The Insularity of America and the Triumph of the Humblest Creatures 464
   8. British Criticisms of American Society: Frances Wright and Mrs. Trollope 468
   9. Echoes of Mrs. Trollope: Pro-Americanism and Anti-Americanism in Stendhal and Jacquemont 479
   X. Other Critics of the Right: Anthony Trollope and Thomas Hamilton 487
   XI. Critics of the Left: Miss Martineau and Captain Marryat 491
   XII. Dickens: Nature and Society Equally Putrescent 497
   XIII. Reactions in the United States 508
      A. Emerson and the Freshness of American Culture 508
      B. Lowell and Melville: Messianism and Desperation 513
      C. Thoreau: Primitivism Rediscovered 519
      D. Walt Whitman: The Athletic Democracy's Empathic Oracles 529
   XIV. The Polemic's Last Metamorphosis: Immigrants and Expatriates 543
   XV. The Young World Quite Old 552
   XVI. De Pauw's Oblivion and Secret Immortality 556
   XVII. The Scientific Revision of the Buffonian Calumny 560

9. Supplements and Digressions 565
   1. The Originality of Buffon 565
   2. The Tropicalization of the White Man 571
   3. The Mexicans' Human Sacrifices 576
   4. The Impotence of Nature 579
   5. The Quakers, the Marquis, and the Girondist 584
   6. A Latecomer and His Disciple: Drouin de Bercy and Giuseppe Compagnoni 603

Bibliography of Works Cited 631
Suggestions for Further Research 655
Index 671